Climate Change & The Future of Isolated Trout Populations: Can the PNW bull trout experience inform CRCT conservation? Dan Isaak, US Forest Service



General outline: 1) 21st-Century model predictions for Rocky Mountain trout

2) 20th-Century observed patterns in climate & trout populations

 Better spatial data to assist decision making. (the BIG DATA approach, the local monitoring approach)

4) Key future uncertainties (resolvable & not)

Parallel Structure to New Overview Paper...

Feature: FISHERIES MANAGEMENT

The Past as Prelude to the Future for Understanding 21st-Century Climate Effects on Rocky Mountain Trout

Isaak, ... Roberts, ... Fausch. 2012. Fisheries **37:** 542-556.

Two conservation species





Five case history areas







ExtensiveHabitat fragmentation?ModerateNoFluvial fish?YesSpringSpawning period?FallWideThermal niche?Narrow



Natural Gradient in Habitat Size & Fragmentation







Bioclimate Models for Trout Rockies are model central!



Eaton & Schaller 1996 Keleher & Rahel 1996 Rahel et al. 1996 Mohseni et al. 2003 Flebbe et al. 2006 Rieman et al. 2007 Kennedy et al. 2008 Williams et al. 2009











Most Recent Trout Climate Assessment



Wenger et al. 2011. PNAS 108:14175-14180

Mechanisms of Inter-specific Variation in Climate Response





Brook trout occurrence?

Wenger et al. 2011. CJFAS 68:988-1008.

Context Matters: Spatial Variation in Habitat Loss





Observed Trends in Runoff Timing Merced (1948-2000)



Stewart et al. 2005

Earlier snowmelt & river runoff





Wildfires Increasing Westwide



Sediment Regimes

Fire & Disturbance





Burned & debris flow



Temperature Trends In Northwest Rivers







Factors Confounding Stream Warming = Urbanization + Reservoirs

Rising stream and river temperatures in the United States

Sujay S Kaushal^{1*}, Gene E Likens², Norbert A Jaworski³, Michael L Pace^{2†}, Ashley M Sides¹, David Seekell⁴, Kenneth T Belt⁵, David H Secor¹, and Rebecca L Wingate¹



Kaushal et al. 2010. Frontiers in Ecology & the Environment

Are There "Pristine" Sites with Long-term Data to Serve as Climate Sentinels?

764 USGS gages have some temperature data



USGS NWIS Database (http://waterdata.usgs.gov/nwis)

Seasonal Trends In Northwest Stream Temperatures (1980-2009)



What's causing it? Attribution of Stream Warming Trends Air Temperature Discharge



Spring Summer Fall Winter Isaak et al. 2011. Climatic Change 113:499-524.

Streams are Tracking Air Temperatures



Air Trends as Stream Temperature Surrogates? Mean Summer Air Temp Trends (1980 – 2009)



OWSC Climate Tool map

http://www.climate.washington.edu/trendanalysis/

Air Trends as Stream Temperature Surrogates?

009)

brid

Terrain



United States Historical Climatology Network

Select a state from the pulldown list and click "Map Sites" to show its stations on the

http://cdiac.ornl.gov/epubs/ndp/ushcn/ushcn.html



How Are Trout Populations Responding?



Stream Distance

Parmesan and Yohe. 2003 Nature **421:**37-42.

The Bull Trout Vise

Warmer temperatures Reduced summer flows Fire & debris flows Winter flooding Non-native invasions

The Bull Trout Vise

Warmer temperatures Reduced summer flows ?
Fire & debris flows ?
Winter flooding
Non-native invasions ?



CRCT Vise?

Lots of Uncertainties... Where should scarce resources be spent?



Where Can We Make a Difference?



Thermal Regime

Modified from Williams et al. 2007

More Pressure, Fewer Resources





Geospatial Tools for Accurate Regional Scale Stream Models



Accurate Spatial Information (a.k.a. "Maps") Can Reduce Uncertainty Maps are powerful tools, especially if they're "smart"



Still catching up to Lewis & Clarke 200 years later...

BioClimatic Assessments

No stream temperature component



Air Temperatures...

- •Meisner 1988, 1990
- •Eaton & Schaller 1996
- •Keleher & Rahel 1996
- •Rahel et al. 1996
- •Mohseni et al. 2003
- •Flebbe et al. 2006
- •Rieman et al. 2007
- •Kennedy et al. 2008
- •Williams et al. 2009
- •Wenger et al. 2011
- •Almodovar et al. 2011

•Etc.





NorWeST: A Regional Stream Temperature Database & Model for High-Resolution Climate Vulnerability Assessments

Dan Isaak, Seth Wenger¹, Erin Peterson², Jay Ver Hoef³ Charlie Luce, Steve Hostetler⁴, Jason Dunham⁴, Jeff Kershner⁴, Brett Roper, Dave Nagel, Dona Horan, Gwynne Chandler, Sharon Parkes, Sherry Wollrab



Lots of Temperature Data Out There...



NorWeST ≈≈Stream Temp

45,000,000+ hourly records 45,000+ summers measured 15,000+ unique stream sites

MT

Stealth Sensor Network

WA

60+ agencies 350,000 stream km

w

SG
Regional Temperature Model



Accurate temperature

Missoula

Bozeman

models



Cross-jurisdictional "maps"

Boise

of stream temperatures

Moscow

Consistent datum for strategic assessments across 350,000 stream kilometers

Stream Temp

Spatial Statistical Stream Models Valid means of interpolation between sample locations on networks... finally!



Advantages: •Flexible & valid covariance structures that accommodate network topology & autocorrelation

•Much improved predictive ability & parameter estimates relative to non-spatial models

Ver Hoef et al. 2006; Peterson & Ver Hoef 2010; Ver Hoef & Peterson 2010

Example: Salmon River Basin Data extracted from NorWeST



Climatic Variability in Historical Record Extreme years include late 21st-Century "averages"



Salmon River Temperature Model

n = 4,414

Covariate Predictors

Elevation (m)
 Canopy (%)
 Stream slope (%)
 Ave Precipitation (mm)
 Latitude (km)
 Lakes upstream (%)
 Glaciers upstream (%)
 Baseflow Index
 Watershed size (km²)
 Discharge (m³/s)*
 Air Temperature (°C)[#]

* = USGS gage data
= NCEP RegCM3 reanalysis

Mean August Temperature 25 r² = 0.60; RMSE = 1.68°C 20 15 Predicted (Non-spatial Model 10 15 20 25 r² = 0.89; RMSE = 0.86°C 15 10 **Spatial Model** 5 15 25 10 20 5 Observed (

Clearwater River Temp Model

n = 4,487

Covariate Predictors

Elevation (m)
 Canopy (%)
 Stream slope (%)
 Ave Precipitation (mm)
 Latitude (km)
 Lakes upstream (%)
 Glaciers upstream (%)
 Baseflow Index
 Watershed size (km²)
 Discharge (m³/s)
 Air Temperature (°C)

Mean August Temperature





Relative Effects of Predictors

Warming Cooling



* = statistically significant at p < 0.01

Climate Scenario Maps Many possibilities once model exists...



Adjust air & discharge values to represent scenarios





Effects on Thermal Habitat Define using thermal criteria







Salmon River Bull Trout Habitats

2002-2011 Historical 11.2 °C isotherm Suitable Unsuitable

Salmon River Bull Trout Habitats

+1°C Stream Temperature 11.2 °C isotherm Suitable Unsuitable





Salmon River Bull Trout Habitats

+2°C Stream Temperature

11.2 °C isotherm

Suitable Unsuitable







Difference Map Shows Vulnerable Habitats +1°C stream temperature scenario

Where to invest?

Where Should Restoration Efforts Occur? Need to be Tactically & Strategically Smart

Maintaining/restoring flow
Maintaining/restoring riparian
Restoring channel form/function

Continuous Resource Maps Will Facilitate Terrestrial-Aquatic Integration

& aquatics fit in?







Rieman et al. 2010 BioScience

Big Leap of Faith

GCM







Management Decisions

Models Developed from Everyone's Data Coordinated Management Response

Management

Decisions

GCM



≥USGS

NOAA Fisheri

Data Collected by Local Bios & Hydros

Temperature (°C) • 5.35-7.92 • 7.92-10.5

Observed (°C)





NorWeST Blob Growing... 8,888 summers of data swallowed so far...



NorWeST Temperature model timelines (~3rd code HUCs)



NorWeST Website Coming... Launch scheduled this winter GIS maps of climate scenarios





Southy Man Research Martin Will's Sole Programs Adv, Minter Asymptot Revenue Research Station Horse & Science Revenue Address & Mr. Write and Address & Revenue

 Sock Humber (Reserve) Stocks (Hots + Superce Property Auto + Ar., Water and Adaptica + Book fail Schem Temperature Rodeling and Monitoring

Stream Temperature Modeling and Monitoring

Website for Distribution

3 Million II Construction Million Antony 9 Million Antony Millione Requestion applic inspectrum sugars, angularity inferenting systems (200, needs inviting increading), and neil applications are following the development of heapendared results of eventrang methods application in the date plants are provided application of the plant applications and the plant application for the plant applications and the plant application of the plant

The Paper Yoursellan Monorphy Committee Children / Utile Resource 1 (Dear-Image Abst Full-action

More Precise Bioclimatic Assessments



Consistent Thermal Niche Definitions

Stream temperature maps

Regional fish survey databases (n = 10,000)



Occurrence probability 0.0 0.2 0.4 0.6

NorWeST ≈stream Temp

> 10 15 20 25 air temperature(C)

Wenger et al. 2011a. PNAS 108:14175-14180

Wenger et al. 2011b. CJFAS 68:988-1008; Wenger et al., In Preparation

Generalizable to All Stream Biotas Just need georeferenced biological survey data



Too warm...Too cold...Just right



Western U.S. Flow Metrics Webpage

Website: http://www.fs.fed.us/rm/boise/AWAE/projects/ modeled_stream_flow_metrics.shtml



Wenger et al. 2010. Water Resources Research 46, W09513

Structured Decision Making



High Resolution Information Landscape Specific Conditions





Invest here

Not here

Efficient Biological Monitoring Distributional status & trend

Proportion

anybull brook

rainbow



Precise, representative sample

ake Cr



survey

Regionally Consistent Framework Bull trout status & trend monitoring





More Efficient Temperature Monitoring



Sampling distribution





Real-time Access to Stream Spatial Data Anytime, Anywhere Smartphones as field computers


First "Killer Apps" but more coming...







In the Pipeline...



"Block-kriging" of stream-scale population estimates
Optimized monitoring designs for biological & water quality parameters
Improved fish distribution maps & models
Precise thermal niche definitions for trout
Improved climate vulnerability assessments

An InterNet for Stream Data

GIS infrastructure now exists...



•350,000 stream kilometers

Big Data Powers Big Models... but Local Monitoring is Where it All Starts

UTBI-001



NV

UT



Easy Method for Full Year Monitoring Underwater Epoxy Protocol Annual Flooding



Underwater epoxy



\$130 = 5 years of data

Data retrieved

from underwater

Deili hol

Sensors or PVC housings glued to large boulders

Isaak & Horan 2011. NAJFM 31:134-137

Big Boulders & Small Sensors



Bridge pilings, roadbed riprap...

Significant Monitoring Gap: Full Year Temperatures from Unregulated Rivers



NoRRTN: Northern Rockies River Temperature Network



•70 rivers;
•3 replicates/river;
•n = 210 sites;
•2 technicians;
•1 summer of work;
•Cost = \$50,000;



Full Year Stream Temperature Monitoring Becoming Popular... 2,761 Current full-year monitoring sites ~500 New deployments last year

University of Idaho

idaho Power

JOAA Fisherie

A GoogleMap Tool for Dynamic Queries of Temperature Monitoring Sites Regional Sensor Network



Site Information

Stream name

•Data steward contact information

AgencySite Initiation Date

287



These pearst rations

Google maps

Gel Elitections My Maps

Montana Annual Stream Temperature ints available www.ts.3ed.us/mvlinsss/AW/AE/moiects

Save to My Maps

temperature shtml

am Temperature Points available by Agency

2/Q2/2011 50 views - Public Created on Fail 2 - Updated (2 mouse upp Ter

Fine the map - White a comment-

Adair Creat

Thermograph Location: Adain Creek Contact: Clint Muhifeld - cmuhifeld@usgs.gov (405-888-7925) USGS, NOROCK.

 Agassiz Creek Thermograph Locs

Thermograph Location: Agassiz Creek Contact: Clint Muhfeld - cmuhfeld@usgs.gov (406-888-7926) USGS, NOROCK

Akokala Cree

 Thermograph Location: Akokala Creek Contact: Clint Muhifeld - cmuhifeld@usgs.gov (406-666-7926) USGS, NOROCK.

Query Individual Sites

View in Google Earth

Continental Monitoring Network Emerging



Monitoring Sites in CRCT Range



Mike Golden Matt Grove Kelly Larkin-McKim Rick Henderson Andrew Briebart Gwynne Chandler

Stream-Specific Climate Change Scenarios Calculation of Stream Isotherm Shifts

Stream temperature lapse rate (°C / 100 m)
 Long-term stream warming rate (°C / decade)
 Stream slope (degrees)
 Stream sinuosity



Isaak & Rieman. 2012. Global Change Biology 18, doi: 10.1111/gcb.12073

Key BioClimate Model Assumption: Critical isotherm delimits species boundary...



What is an Isotherm? How does it apply to streams?

Isotherm = Line connecting

locations with equal temperatures



Distance

Stream plan view

A Use for High School Trigonometry!

Step 1. Calculate vertical displacement for a given stream lapse rate and long-term warming rate.



Step 3. Multiply slope distance by stream sinuosity ratio in meandering streams.

Isotherm Shift Rate Curves

Stream lapse rate = 0.8 °C / 100 m



Isaak & Rieman. 2012. Global Change Biology 18, doi: 10.1111/gcb.12073

Isotherm Shift Rate Curves

Stream lapse rate = 0.8 °C / 100 m



Isaak & Rieman. 2012. Global Change Biology 18, doi: 10.1111/gcb.12073

River Network Climate Velocity Map



sensu Loarie et al. 2009. Nature 462:1052-1055.

If It's Steep, It Will Slow the Creep... Topography will be our Frien-emy



Mainstem Fisheries Will See First & Most Pronounced Thermal Impacts



Wednesday, September 29, 2004 Fishing

High Water Temperature In Grande Ronde Kills 239 Adult Spring Chinook Columbia Basin Bulletin, August 14, 2009 (PST) Headwater Populations Is it a problem? How much time left on the clock?

> Higher Elevation habitats

Elevation

Thermal refugia nonexistent

Populations with ≤ 5 stream km in trouble by 2050

CRCT Habitats Often Too Cold...



Harig et al. 2000; Harig & Fausch 2002; Coleman & Fausch 2007

... But Now Are Slowly Thawing...

+0.26 °C/decade from 1970-2011





Air warming 0.26 °C/ decade ~ a) stream warming 0.15 °C/decade ~ 0.5 - 1 km/decade isotherm shift in 1% - 5% slopes

b) stream warming 0.15 °C/decade ~ +20 degree days/decade ~ +80 degree days by 2050.

... & New Habitats Will Come Online



Harig et al. 2000; Harig & Fausch 2002; Coleman & Fausch 2007

Sensor Technology for Stream Discharge

Traditional technique = labor intensive & expensive



Portable Doppler Velocimeter



Pressure Transducers



New discharge sensors = new possibilities

Hydrologic Models for Tiny Streams? Why model it if it can be directly measured?



Year 1 Measurement = Habitat Size



Year 2 Measurement minus Year 1 Measurement = Climate Sensitivity



Year 2 Measurement minus Year 1 Measurement = Climate Sensitivity



Much Can Be Done to Inform This Question Where should scarce resources be spent?



Significant Unknowns: Where Do We Level Off (+1C, +3C, etc.) & When Do We Get There?



10WNS: et Wetter or Dryer?



U.S. Climate Change Science Program. 2009

Precipitation Declines = Habitat Reductions / Loss?



Significant Unknowns: How Fast Are Fish Distributions Shifting?



Power Analysis for Trend Detection How long does monitoring have to occur?



Year

Streams differ in thermal variation which masks warming trend

Stream	Summer SD	Annual SD
NFK Clearwater	1.41	0.70
Fir Creek	0.82	0.51
Missouri R.	1.17	0.64
SFK Bull River	0.86	0.55
NFK Bull River	0.36	0.44
Bull River	0.82	0.58

Isaak et al. 2012. Climatic Change

Elevation

Stream Distance

16 °C isotherm & 95% Cl

Power Curves for Isotherm Shifts

2 – 6 decades for statistically significant changes



Isaak & Rieman. 2012. Global Change Biology 18, doi: 10.1111/gcb.12073
Empirical Evidence in the Short-Term Resample historical sites along stream profiles

ALTITUDINAL DISTRIBUTION OF BROWN TROUT AND OTHER FISHES IN A HEADWATER TRIBUTARY OF THE SOUTH PLATTE RIVER, COLORADO

ROBERT E. VINCENT AND WILLIAM H. MILLER¹ Colorado Cooperative Fishery Unit, Colorado State University, Fort Collins, Colorado 80521

(MS received August 9, 1968; accepted March 10, 1969)

Species

Brook trout
Brown trout
White sucker
Longnose day

(3) Longnose sucks(4) Creek chub

(5) Sand shines

(6) Bigmouth shise
(7) Fathead mintor
(8) Common shiae
(9) Brassy minnow

Site number and elevation (m)

33 12

28 24

2,234 2,030 2,015 1,591 1,559 1,524 1,510 1,490 1,470 1,423

19 12

27 27

Mountain-Great Plains Stream: Biotic Zonation and Additive Patterns of Community Change

FRANK J. RAHEL

Department of Zoology and Physiology, University of Wyoming Laramie, Wyoming 82071, USA

Transactions of the American Fisheries Society 120:319-332, 1991

DISTRIBUTION AND ABUNDANCE OF FISHES IN SAGEHEN CREEK, CALIFORNIA

RICHARD GARD, School of Forestry and Conservation, University of California, Berkeley 94720¹ GLENN A. FLITTNER, Bureau of Marine Sciences, California State University, San Diego 92100

J. Wildl. Manage. 38(2):1974



Broad Distributional Resurveys Assess site extirpation/colonization frequencies relative to temperature



Beever et al. 2003; 2010



Significant Unknowns: How Much Habitat is Needed to Persist?



How Much Habitat is Needed to Persist?



Peterson et al., In Preparation

Extremes May Become More Extreme...



http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/extremes/cei/graph/1c/ytd

Number of Climatic "Events" May Increase Dramatically



Jentsch et al. 2007



Can "Bombproof" Habitats Be Developed?

Feature: FISHERIES MANAGEMENT

Native Fish Conservation Areas: A Vision for Large-Scale Conservation of Native Fish Communities

Jack E. Williams, Richard N. Williams, Russell F. Thurow, Leah Elwell, David P. Philipp, Fred A. Harris, Jeffrey L. Kershner, Patrick J. Martinez, Dirk Miller, Gordon H. Reeves, Christopher A. Frissell, and James R. Sedell



Fisheries • VOL 36 NO 6 • JUNE 2011 • WWW.FISHERIES.ORG

Can "Bombproof" Habitats Be Developed?



The Past as Prelude to the Future for Understanding 21st-Century Climate Effects on Rocky Mountain Trout

Isaak, ... Roberts, ... Fausch. 2012. Fisheries **37**: 542-556.

Can "Bombproof" Habitats Be Developed?

& Replicate Across As Many Areas as Possible

Largest Plus Nearest...

The Past as Prelude to the Future for Understanding 21st-Century Climate Effects on Rocky Mountain Trout

Isaak, ... Roberts, ... Fausch. 2012. Fisheries **37**: 542-556.



Focus Efforts Where We Make a Difference Do the Smartest Things in the Smartest Places

Regional Bioclimatic Context





Linked to Landscape Level Models that Inform Local Actions







The Sooner We Act, The Bigger The Impact







Air Temperature Warming Rates in US (1970 – 2011)...

CLIMATE CO CENTRAL

http://www.climatecentral.org/news/the-heat-is-on/

"Heat is on report" Tebaldi 2012

0.6

0.4

0.2

0.0

Change

F per decade

Air Temperature Warming Rates in CO/WY/UT (1970 – 2011)...





Relevant Publications...

FEATURE Socio-economics

The Past as Prelude to the Future for Understanding 21st-Century Climate Effects on Rocky Mountain Trout

Isaak, ... Roberts, ... Fausch. 2012. Fisheries **37**: 542-556.

Predicting isotherm shifts in streams...

Global Change Biology

Global Chauge Bsology (2012), doi: 10.1111/gcb.12073 (Online at lang "soline/library wiley.com/journal/10.1111/s2805583/0291365-2486 accepted)

Stream isotherm shifts from climate change and implications for distributions of ectothermic organisms

DANIEL J. ISAAK* AND BRUCE E. RIEMAN†

*U.S. Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station, Boise Aquatic Sciences Laboratory, 322 E. Front St., Suite 401, Boise, Idaho #U.S. Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station (refired), P.O. Box 1541, Seeley Lake, MT

Isaak & Rieman. 2012. Global Change Biology 19, doi: 12073



 What is changing in the climate and related physical processes that may influence aquatic species and their habitats?
What are the implications for fish populations, aquatic communities and related conservation values?
What can we do about it?

> Rieman & Isaak 2010. USFS Report.

Stream Temperature Publications...

Stream Temperature Modeling Approach...

Ecological Applications, 20(5), 2010, pp. 1350–1371. © 2010 by the Ecological Society of America

Effects of climate change and wildfire on stream temperatures and salmonid thermal habitat in a mountain river network

DANIEL J. ISAAK, 13 CHARLES H. LUCE, 1 BRUCE E. REMAN, 1 DAVID E. NAGEL, 1 ERIN E. PETERSON, 2 DONA L. HORAN, SHARON PARKES,¹ AND GWYNNE L. CHANDLER

U.S. Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station, Boise Aquatic Sciences Laboratory, 322 E. Front Street, Suite 401, Bobse, Idaho 83702 USA ²Communicable Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO), Division of Mathematical and Information Sciences, Industringilly, Queensland, Australia

Regional Stream Temperature Trends...

Climate change effects on stream and river temperatures across the northwest U.S. from 1980-2009 and implications for salmonid fishes

Climatic Change D. J. Isaak, S. Wollrab, G. Chandler

An Interdisciplinary, International Journal Devoted to the Description, Causes and Implications of Climatic Change Co-Editor: MICHAEL OPPENHEIMER GARY VOHE

Epoxy field test and validation work ...

An Evaluation of Underwater Epoxies to Permanently Install **Temperature Sensors in Mountain Streams**

Daniel J. Isaak* and Dona L. Horan

U.S. Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station, B 322 East Front Street, Suite 401, Boise, Idaho 83702, US





Epoxy "How-to" protocol...



A Simple Method Using Underwater Epoxy to Permanently Install Temperature Sensors in Mountain Streams (Version 3.12; updated 2/02/2012)

> Dan Isaak (disaak@fs.fed.us), Dona Horan (dhoran@fs.fed.us), and Sherry Wollrab (sherrywollrab@fs.fed.us)

Stream Temperature Website

Google "Forest Service Stream Temperature"



• Stream temperature publications & project descriptions & recent talks

• Protocols for temperature data collection & demonstration videos

• Processing macro for temperature data

• Dynamic GoogleMap showing current temperature monitoring sites

The End