## **Appendix**

## A: Proposed Amendment to the Forest Plan for Alternatives 3 and 4<sup>13</sup>

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
Chapter 2 - Issues	9	Off-Road Driving Off-road driving (often referred to as ORV use) is an important recreational experience for some publics and is increasing, especially two- and three-wheeled vehicles. Such use damages the environment in some areas or results in conflicts with other users. The forest is open to off-road driving except where designated closed.	Motor Vehicle Use Motor vehicle use is limited to designated roads, trails, and areas on the forest. Motor vehicle use off designated roads and trails and outside of designated areas is prohibited, except where exempted under 36 CFR 212.51.
		Off-road driving permits people access to resources like firewood. Some types of use have a severe impact on soils, vegetation, wildlife, and some other users.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
		Quantifiable Description – Year 2030 Acres in Thousands Open Closed or seasonally restricted 1,491 331 (includes 150,000 acres of wilderness) Nonquantifiable Description Off-road driving is provided commensurate with resource management objectives and budget levels.	Text deleted; superseded by new forestwide direction.
Chapter 2 - Issues	12	Mid-Decade Annual Road Operation and Maintenance Program  Decade 1 Decade 2  Levels 1-2 100 miles 200 miles  Levels 3-5 1,000 miles 1,400 miles  Not requiring annual maintenance 2,625 miles 2,375 miles  Not maintained to Standard 2,425 miles 1,775 miles	Text deleted; superseded by new forestwide direction.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Bold text represents reworded or new language. *Italics explain deletions or modifications* 

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
		Road maintenance funding is slightly above current in the first decade, but will not be adequate to stop the disinvestment of the road system. Disinvestment will be reduced as road maintenance funding is increased over the planning period. Roads not needed for effective use and administration of forest resources are obliterated at a rate of 40 miles per year. Intermittent roads are closed and the public is informed. Four hundred and ninety-five miles of roads are reconstructed and maintained to the latest asbuild standard that will perpetuate the roads without the need for capital investment funds. The remainder of the road system will be reconstructed on a rotational cycle based on a needs and benefit/cost analysis. Others are maintained for user safety and resource protection.	Road maintenance funding is slightly above current in the first decade, but will not be adequate to stop the disinvestment of the road system. Disinvestment will be reduced as road maintenance funding is increased over the planning period. Roads not needed for effective use and administration of forest resources are obliterated <b>as funding becomes available</b> . Intermittent roads are closed and the public is informed. Four hundred and ninety-five miles of roads are reconstructed and maintained to the latest asbuild standard that will perpetuate the roads without the need for capital investment funds. The remainder of the road system will be reconstructed on a rotational cycle based on a needs and benefit/cost analysis. Others are maintained for user safety and resource protection.
Chapter 3 – Goals	22	Manage off-road driving to provide opportunities while protecting resources and minimizing conflicts with other users.	Motor vehicle use is allowed only on designated roads, trails, and areas unless exempted (36 CFR 212.51).
Chapter 4 – Forestwide Standards and Guidelines	58	Off-Road Driving Management Annually review and update the Off-road Driving Implementation Schedule; amend the implementation schedule as needed to prevent resource damage and/or user conflicts. Areas are closed to off-road driving when adverse resource impacts occur, when conflicts with the minimum management requirements occur, or if areas are too sensitive to withstand driving. The annual implementation schedule will provide for removal of forest products on administered sales.  By the second year of the decade prepare a forestwide inventory of off-road driving opportunities and use. Based on the inventory, by the fourth year of the decade update the Off-road Driving Implementation Schedule, and develop and sign an appropriate series of loop trails in various parts of the forest to disperse use and to provide a variety of experiences in coordination with the ROS management classes.  Prepare an ROG or other literature describing and explaining the off-road driving program. Review annually and update as needed.  Work with representatives of the spectrum of motorized users (including 2, 3, & 4 wheeled vehicles) in developing, designating, and providing information on off-road driving opportunities. This will have special emphasis in MA 13, the	Motor Vehicle Management Roads, trails, and areas designated for motor vehicle use are identified on a motor vehicle use map (MVUM). The MVUM is reviewed and republished annually.  Motor vehicle use off designated roads and trails and outside of designated areas is prohibited, except where exempted under 36 CFR 212.51.  Motor vehicles are permitted to travel up to 300 feet off either side of designated routes for dispersed camping.  Rest of text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
		Cinder Hills, but will be applied over the major part of the forest. Monitor motor vehicle use to determine the effectiveness of the Off-road Driving Implementation Schedule. Repair damage where cost effective and unacceptable environmental damage is occurring. Implement appropriate measures to prevent or minimize damage.  Areas closed to off-road driving at the beginning of the planning period are identified on the Off-road Driving Management Plan Map. Restrictions may be year-round or seasonal. There may be other restricted areas in the future that are not yet identified. Opportunities for recreational off-road driving will be considered in the road closure planning process. For example, existing roads which have eroded to a rock surface and are not likely to continue to erode may be left open and managed as motorized trails to provide a challenging driving experience when determined appropriate through an environmental analysis. These trails are signed for off-road vehicles and are not part of the regular road system. They are not included when calculating the average road density per mile, but should be considered in evaluating wildlife habitat. The following criteria are used to evaluate the need for future closures or restrictions:  - Soils that are receiving, or are expected to receive, damage to the extent that soil productivity will be significantly impaired.	
Chapter 4 – Forestwide Standards and Guidelines	59	[cont. from page 85] - Slopes exceeding 40 percent where high probability for damage exists Riparian areas being threatened or damaged Meadows likely to be or being damaged Areas adjacent to stream courses where potential for sedimentation is high Areas within watercourses or wetlands (permanently or intermittently wet) Where the visual quality objectives (VQO) of preservation, retention, or partial retention are jeopardized Areas of important cultural resource sites vulnerable to damage that are being threatened or damaged Tree plantations less than 10 years old that are likely to be damaged Habitat for threatened, endangered, or sensitive species that is	Text deleted; superseded by new forestwide direction.

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
		threatened.  - Key wildlife areas being threatened or damaged.  - Areas important to wildlife reproduction, such as, fawning or nesting areas, where disturbance is causing, or likely to cause, significant stress and reduction of reproductive success.  - Restrictions or closures needed to meet road management objectives.  - Areas within municipal watersheds.  - Areas where user conflict must be resolved to ensure public safety.  - Areas considered to be dangerous for winter off-road driving activities.  - Dispersed recreation areas where conflicts exist.  Manageability will be an important criterion in establishing boundaries of areas with restrictions.  Other areas may be seasonally closed to provide opportunities for recreation in a setting without vehicular disturbance such as temporarily changing the ROS class social and managerial settings toward the primitive end of the spectrum. Initially, the Pine Grove and Rattlesnake areas, of approximately 12,600 and 11,100 acres, respectively, are closed annually from August 15 through December 31. These areas are monitored and, based on evaluation of monitoring results, maintained, added to, or cancelled.	Maintain langauge:" the Pine Grove and Rattlesnake areas, of approximately 12,600 and 11,100 acres, respectively, are closed to motorized use annually from August 15 through December 31." to keep these areas non-motorized even with designation of motorized big game retrieval.
Chapter 4 – Forestwide Standards and Guidelines	59	Law enforcement is planned and implemented to minimize resource damage and user conflicts. Signing is appropriate to inform the public and help minimize the need for direct law enforcement activities.	No change to text; move above the "Bicycle Use" heading.
Chapter 4 – Forestwide Standards and Guidelines	60	Implement off-road driving restrictions in areas where roads are closed or obliterated and restrictions are necessary to prevent reopening of the roads by motor vehicle users.  Focus media attention on off-road driving management at least annually to enlist public cooperation. Feature volunteer organizations working to improve management.	Text deleted; superseded by new forestwide direction.

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
Chapter 4 – Forestwide Standards and Guidelines	89	Manage road densities to achieve an average of 1.1 miles of open road per section in the woodland zone, such as pinyon-juniper, desert, and grassland vegetation types and an average of 2 miles of open road per section in the ponderosa pine/mixed conifer zone. These densities reflect all system roads in maintenance categories 2 through 5, but do not include Federal, State, and county systems. Temporary roads that are only for short-term use and will then be fully obliterated and long-term closure roads are not a part of the calculated density. In calculating densities by vegetative type do not include areas having legal or administrative restrictions on roads, e.g., wilderness and research natural areas  Road densities are based on road density objectives, the resources served, user types, and topography to meet the objectives for management of resources served, using guidance from R3 publication "Skidding Distance Versus Road Cost Optimization for Timber Sales."	Change sentence that reads "These densities reflect all system roads in maintenance categories 2 through 5, but do not include Federal, State, and county systems." To "These densities reflect all designated system roads in maintenance categories 2 through 5, but do not include Federal, State, and county systems."
Chapter 4 – MA 3 Standards and Guidelines	119	The trails are for nonmotorized traffic only, except Schultz Creek Trail which is open to motorized vehicles.	The trails are for nonmotorized traffic only.  Rest of text deleted; the Schultz Creek Trail was closed to motorized vehicles in Amendment 17 but this page was never corrected.
Chapter 4 – MA 3 Standards and Guidelines	120	Schultz Creek trail will remain open to all types of use.	Text deleted; Schultz Creek Trail was closed to motorized vehicles in Amendment 17 but this page was never corrected.
Chapter 4 – MA 3 Standards and Guidelines	137	Generally, local roads are closed until the next entry by signing and physical obstruction such as gates or barriers. Temporary roads are obliterated and returned to production. If necessary to ensure protection, off-road driving restrictions are imposed until roads are fully revegetated.	Generally, local roads are closed until the next entry by signing and physical obstruction such as gates or barriers. Temporary roads are not open to public motorized travel (36 CFR 212) and are obliterated and returned to production [rest of text deleted].
Chapter 4 – MA 3 Standards and Guidelines	140	Trails are for nonmotorized use, except in Schultz Creek adjacent to Forest Road 420 up to Road 789.	Trails are for nonmotorized use unless designated through a National Environmental Policy Act planning process.  Rest of text deleted; Schultz Creek Trail was closed to motorized vehicles in Amendment 17 but this page was never corrected.

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
Chapter 4 – MA 9 Standards and Guidelines	159	Closely monitor off-road driving. If damage is occurring or becomes imminent, apply and enforce appropriate restrictions (see forestwide standards and guidelines - recreation program component for criteria).  Focus media attention on off-road driving damage in these sensitive areas at least annually.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 10 Standards and Guidelines	163	Vehicle traffic permitted only on designated roadways, with the exception of access to fences (for repair), for maintenance of utilities, traversing the right-of-way, and for stock management by permittees of the national forest.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 13 Standards and Guidelines	179	This MA is designated for off-road driving and is managed for two and four wheeled vehicles.  Manage off-road driving to provide recreational opportunities and coordinate with needs of other recreation users and other resources.  Make slight adjustments to the boundary of the OHV area where needed to ease administration of the site. These changes will improve enforcement of the boundaries, help users identify the area, and in combination with other access management activities will lessen encroachment into the monument. Consider fencing or other physical barriers a means of boundary identification. The boundary has been slightly revised on the southwest corner of the area for administrative identification. There is no significant change in the size of the area, but it is adjusted to roads or features that are identifiable on the ground. The map in appendix M has been revised to reflect what is currently posted on the ground.	This MA is designated for OHV use and is managed for two and four wheeled vehicles.  Manage OHV use to provide recreational opportunities and coordinate with needs of other recreation users and other resources.  Make slight adjustments to the boundary of the OHV area where needed to ease administration of the site. These changes will improve enforcement of the boundaries, help users identify the area, and in combination with other access management activities will lessen encroachment into the monument. Consider fencing or other physical barriers a means of boundary identification.  The boundary has been slightly revised on the southwest corner of the area for administrative identification. There is no significant change in the size of the area, but it is adjusted to roads or features that are identifiable on the ground. The map in appendix M has been revised to reflect what is currently posted on the ground.
Chapter 4 – MA 13 Standards and Guidelines	180	See the Objectives for Recreation Opportunity Spectrum map (appendix M) and manage uses to meet these objectives. On busy summer weekends, the number of encounters with other recreationists will likely be outside parameters set for semiprimitive settings and this is acceptable.  Reference the Cinder Hills Off-Road Driving Area Report (Peaks Ranger District). This report is a detailed desired condition that will be validated or changed via subsequent site-specific NEPA analysis. This report includes a map of the desired improved roads, camping areas, specific slope designations, rehabilitation	See the Objectives for Recreation Opportunity Spectrum map (appendix M) and manage uses to meet these objectives. On busy summer weekends, the number of encounters with other recreationists will likely be outside parameters set for semiprimitive settings and this is acceptable.  Reference the "Cinder Hills Off-Road Driving Area Report" (Peaks Ranger District). This report is a detailed desired condition that will be validated or changed via subsequent sitespecific NEPA analysis. This report includes a map of the desired improved roads, camping areas, specific slope

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
		needs, sanitation facilities, signing, boundary management, information, and interpretation actions. The report will be updated as needed with involvement from off-road vehicle users, Native American tribes, and others concerned with Cinder Hills use. Requiring a permit and/or charging a fee may be considered in the future. Operation of the area by a concessionaire may be considered.  Portions of this MA will be open to unrestricted cross-country travel, portions will have use restricted to designated routes, and portions will be closed (some slopes).	designations, rehabilitation needs, sanitation facilities, signing, boundary management, information, and interpretation actions. The report will be updated as needed with involvement from OHV users, Native American tribes, and others concerned with Cinder Hills use. Requiring a permit and/or charging a fee may be considered in the future. Operation of the area by a concessionaire may be considered.  This MA is open to unrestricted cross-country travel except where signed closed. Other portions may be closed in the future based on reasons listed below. The area also contains some designated routes for entry and navigation through the area.
Chapter 4 – MA 15 Standards and Guidelines	189	Maintain facilities at Condition Class Level I. Repair minor site damage within 1 year and major site damage within 2 years. Sites are closed to off-road driving, unless specific management needs are identified for such things as administration, construction, or maintenance. Sites are closed to vehicles and operators not licensed for highway use in the State of Arizona.	Maintain facilities at Condition Class Level I. Repair minor site damage within 1 year and major site damage within 2 years.  [Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction and State of Arizona law.]
Chapter 4 – MA 16 Standards and Guidelines	192	Limit vehicle access to city and Federal vehicles necessary to administer the area. The area is closed to livestock use and recreational livestock use such as horses, mules, or llamas. The area is closed to off-road driving use.	Limit vehicle access to city and Federal vehicles necessary to administer the area. The area is closed to livestock use and recreational livestock use such as horses, mules, or llamas. [Rest of text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.]
Chapter 4 – MA 17 Standards and Guidelines	195	Prohibit off-road driving.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 18 Standards and Guidelines	199	Enforce off-road driving closures. Make a special effort through the schools and the media to focus public attention on the importance of complying with the closure for all areas.	[Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.] Make a special effort through the schools and the media to focus public attention on the importance of complying with the <b>motorized</b> closure for all areas.
Chapter 4 – MA 19 Standards and Guidelines	202	Close MA 19 to off-road driving, except for vehicles traveling over-the-snow such as snowmobiles or in the vicinity of Knoll Lake, please refer to Off-road Driving Map.	MA 19 and the vicinity of Knoll Lake are open to over-snow vehicles such as snowmobiles.
Chapter 4 – MA 19 Standards and Guidelines	202	Sites are closed to off-road driving, unless specific management needs are identified for such things as administration, construction, or maintenance. Sites are closed to vehicles and operators not licensed for highway use in the State of Arizona.	Sites are closed to vehicles and operators not licensed for highway use in the State of Arizona.

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
Chapter 4 – Sedona Area- wide Standards and Guidelines	206-12	Restrict motor vehicles to system roads and trails in the planning area, except as authorized by permit.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – Sedona Area- wide Standards and Guidelines	206-24	Off-road driving is prohibited within most of the Sedona/Oak Creek Ecosystem, except under rare circumstances by permit.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – Sedona Area- wide Standards and Guidelines	206-27	Limit travel associated with commercial uses to system roads and trails, or to sites designated in an operating plan for such use.	Limit travel associated with commercial uses to system roads and trails, or to sites designated in an operating plan for such use.
Chapter 4 – MA 25 Standards and Guidelines	206-43	limiting motor vehicle traffic between access corridors and the cliffs.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 26 Standards and Guidelines	206-46	Close to motor vehicles and rehabilitate locations that have been damaged by off-road driving and camping with priority given to Broken Arrow, Schnebly Hill, Cathedral Rock and Carrol Canyon.	Rehabilitate locations that have been damaged by off-highway vehicle driving and camping with priority given to Broken Arrow, Schnebly Hill, Cathedral Rock and Carrol Canyon.
Chapter 4 – MA 26 Standards and Guidelines	206-46	limiting motor vehicle traffic between access corridors and the cliffs.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – FLEA Area-wide Standards and Guidelines	206-70	Consult the Roads Analysis for the FLEA Area report, for desired open road network. Reference this information when conducting project level (site-specific) NEPA analysis to close, obliterate, or upgrade roads.	Text deleted; superseded by new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – FLEA Areawide Standards and Guidelines	206-79	Generally discourage off-road driving within ¼ mile of these sites.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 31 Standards and Guidelines	206-84	Continue motorized travel restrictions similar to the current forest orders where motorized use occurs on designated open roads and trails only.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 31 Standards and Guidelines	206-84	Generally discourage off-road driving within ¼ mile of these sites.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
Chapter 4 – MA 31 Standards and Guidelines	206-85	Discourage off-trail use of any kind on large cinder cones.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 32 Standards and Guidelines	206-88	Discourage off-trail use of any kind on large cinder cones.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 32 Standards and Guidelines	206-88	Enforce the stay on designated roads policy.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 36 Standards and Guidelines	206-105	Discourage off-trail use.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – MA 37 Standards and Guidelines	206-110	Continue the current nonmotorized status in the areas of Skunk and Fay Canyons, Canyon Vista, Fisher Point, and Campbell Mesa.	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction.
Chapter 4 – Monitoring Schedule (Table 14-Monitoring Plan)	209	Item monitored Off-road Driving Compliance and Damage Intent Prevent unacceptable damage to resources and meet provision of forest off-road driving implementation plan.  Monitoring Method/Unit of Measure Area and project reviews, RIM system/Area condition.  Measuring Frequency Annually Percent Accuracy/Precision 80/80 Variability that would initiate Re-evaluation ORV use or damage conflicts with management goals or lowers visual quality level below objectives.	Item monitored Motor vehicle use Intent Impacts of motor vehicle use on designated roads and trails and in designated areas.  Monitoring Method/Unit of Measure Compliance; safety; resource impacts; condition surveys; traffic flow; new unauthorized routes/Administrative Unit Measuring Frequency Annually Percent Accuracy/Precision 80/80 Variability that would initiate Re-evaluation Motor vehicle use or damage conflicts with management goals. Revise designations as necessary.
Appendix H	242-12	Table 9. 10-Year Arterial and Collector Road Reconstruction- Capital Investment	Table deleted; outdated.
Appendix H	242-13-16	Table 10. 10-Year Arterial and Collector Road Upgrade Reconstruction-Purchaser Credit	Table deleted; outdated.

Chapter/ Management Area	Page	Current Plan Direction	Proposed Plan Amendment Direction
Appendix J	242-25- 28	Forest Service Road Management Objectives	Table deleted; superseded by new forestwide direction.
Appendix L	Map 5	[Map Legend] Off-Road Driving Allowed Except: Wilderness Closed to Motor Vehicles Restricted Motor vehicle use on designated routes only Seasonally Restricted Closed to motor vehicle during some seasons	Text deleted; redundant with new forestwide direction. Refer to motor vehicle use map.
Glossary	246 or 247	[No definition]	Designated road, trail, or area A National Forest System road or trail, or an area on National Forest System lands that is designated for motor vehicle use pursuant to 36 CFR 212.51 on a motor vehicle use map.
Glossary	256	[No definition]	MVUM (motor vehicle use map) A map reflecting designated roads, trails, and areas on an administrative unit or a ranger district of the National Forest System.
Glossary	258	ORV Off-road vehicles include all mechanical means of transportation that are capable of traveling over land where no road exists.  Passenger cars, four-wheel drive vehicles, trail bikes, ATVs (all terrain vehicles), and snowmobiles are off-road vehicles.	OHV (off-highway vehicle) Any motor vehicle designed for or capable of cross-country travel on or immediately over land, water, sand, snow, ice, marsh, swampland, or other natural terrain. Over-Snow Vehicle A motor vehicle designed for use over snow and that runs on a track or tracks and/or a ski or skis, while in use over snow.
Glossary	272	Off-highway Vehicle – Any motor vehicle when operated off of highways on forest lands.  Off-road Travel – Overland travel with motorized or nonmotorized vehicles off of established, cleared, and defined routes capable of accommodating such a vehicle.	Text deleted; redundant with definition on page 258.  Text deleted; not used in 36 CFR 212.