



Forest Service  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE

Northern Region, Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forests

R1-24-05

November 2023

# Final Environmental Impact Statement for the Land Management Plan

## *Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative*

### Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forests



We make every effort to create documents that are accessible to individuals of all abilities; however, limitations with our word processing programs may prevent some parts of this document from being readable by computer-assisted reading devices. If you need assistance with any part of this document, please contact the Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forests (208) 935-4239.

In accordance with Federal civil rights law and U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) civil rights regulations and policies, the USDA, its Agencies, offices, and employees, and institutions participating in or administering USDA programs are prohibited from discriminating based on race, color, national origin, religion, sex, gender identity (including gender expression), sexual orientation, disability, age, marital status, family/parental status, income derived from a public assistance program, political beliefs, or reprisal or retaliation for prior civil rights activity, in any program or activity conducted or funded by USDA (not all bases apply to all programs). Remedies and complaint filing deadlines vary by program or incident.

Persons with disabilities who require alternative means of communication for program information (e.g., Braille, large print, audiotape, American Sign Language, etc.) should contact the responsible Agency or USDA's TARGET Center at (202) 720-2600 (voice and TTY) or contact USDA through the Federal Relay Service at (800) 877-8339. Additionally, program information may be made available in languages other than English.

To file a program discrimination complaint, complete the USDA Program Discrimination Complaint Form, AD-3027, found online at [How to File a Program Discrimination Complaint](#) and at any USDA office or write a letter addressed to USDA and provide in the letter all of the information requested in the form. To request a copy of the complaint form, call (866) 632-9992. Submit your completed form or letter to USDA by: (1) mail: U.S. Department of Agriculture, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Civil Rights, 1400 Independence Avenue, SW, Washington, D.C. 20250-9410; (2) fax: (202) 690-7442; or (3) email: [program.intake@usda.gov](mailto:program.intake@usda.gov).

USDA is an equal opportunity provider, employer, and lender.

## **Final Environmental Impact Statement for 2023 Land Management Plan for the Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forests**

Idaho, Clearwater, Lewis, Latah, Shoshone and Benewah Counties, Idaho

### **Lead Agency:**

United States Department of Agriculture (USDA)- Forest Service

### **Cooperating Agencies:**

Idaho County, Idaho  
Clearwater County, Idaho  
State of Idaho

### **Government to Government Consulting Agency:**

Nez Perce Tribe

### **Responsible Official:**

Cheryl Probert  
Forest Supervisor  
USDA Forest Service  
Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forests  
1008 Highway 64, Kamiah, Idaho 83536

### **For More Information Contact:**

Zach Peterson  
Public and Government Relations Staff Officer  
1008 Highway 64 Kamiah, ID 83536  
208-935-4239 or zachary.peterson@usda.gov

Sara Daugherty  
Forest Planner  
1008 Highway 64, Kamiah, Idaho 83536  
208-963-4206 or sara.daugherty@usda.gov

**Abstract:** This Final Environmental Impact Statement documents the analysis of the Preferred Alternative and four additional action alternatives developed for programmatic management of the four million acres of National Forest system lands administered by the Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forests. The purpose is to provide land management direction for the Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forests, combining the 1987 Nez Perce National Forests Land Management Plan and the 1987 Clearwater National Forest Land Management Plan into one plan for the Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forests, now managed as one administrative unit.

## Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative

**Table 1. Comparison of guidelines and standards by alternative**

	Alternative W	Alternative X	Alternative Y	Alternative Z	Preferred Alternative
<b>Forestlands</b>					
<b>MA3 Guidelines- Across all PVT Groups</b>					
MA3-GDL-FOR-05 Snag Retention	Requires a minimum number of snags at the project area, measured in greater than 15" DBH, > 20" DBH and a total split by the lodgepole pine dominance type and all other dominance types.			Alternative Z adds a column and requires snags left that are greater than 10" DBH. The total required number of snags increases to include the 10" snags.	Requires a minimum number of snags at the project area, measured in greater than 15" DBH, > 20" DBH and a total split by the lodgepole pine dominance type and all other dominance types.
MA3-FOR-GDL-06 Live Tree Retention	Minimum of 3 live trees per acre ≥15" DBH should be retained within harvest units as future snags. Trees retained for reasons other than snags count toward this number. Minimum is average across entire timber sale unit and does not mean 3 live trees must be retained on every acre.			Minimum of 7 live trees per acre, with preference towards the largest trees available within harvest units as future snags. Trees retained for reasons other than snags count toward this number. Minimum is average across entire timber sale unit and does not mean 7 live trees must be retained on every acre.	Minimum of 3 live trees per acre ≥15" DBH should be retained within harvest units as future snags. Trees retained for reasons other than snags count toward this number. Minimum is average across entire timber sale unit and does not mean 3 live trees must be retained on every acre.
<b>Recommended Areas</b>					
<b>MA 2 Standards</b>					
MA2-STD-RWILD-02 Winter motorized travel in recommended wilderness	Winter recreation opportunities are consistent with the recreation opportunity spectrum classification of primitive or semi-primitive non-motorized.	No Recommended Wilderness in Alt X	Alternative Y does not recommend two portions of the Hoodoo Idaho Roadless Area, also known as the Great Burn area, which historically have had over the snow use. However, winter motorized travel is still not permitted within the recommended	Winter recreation opportunities are consistent with the recreation opportunity spectrum classification of primitive, semi-primitive non-motorized or semi-primitive motorized.	Winter recreation opportunities shall be compatible with the appropriate recreation opportunity spectrum classification of primitive or semi-primitive non-motorized.

Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative

	Alternative W	Alternative X	Alternative Y	Alternative Z	Preferred Alternative
			wilderness portions.  Winter recreation opportunities are consistent with the recreation opportunity spectrum classification of primitive or semi-primitive non-motorized.		

**Geographic Areas**

**Pilot Knob Geographic Area**

GA-GDL-PK-01  Communication Sites	None	None	Communication site and facility leases should not be renewed in order to protect the prehistoric and historic integrity of the area to the Nez Perce people and to provide an undisturbed location for Nez Perce weyekin.	None	Activities, such as timber harvest, road building, and discretionary minerals actions regulated by the Idaho Roadless Rule but not precluded by the Roadless Rule, should not be authorized unless approved by the Nez Perce Tribal Executive Committee.
---	------	------	---	------	--

**Table 2. MA2 Suitability by alternative (Alt)**

Management Action	Alt W	Alt X	Alt Y	Alt Z	Preferred Alt
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-01.</b> Timber Production	No	NA	No	No	No
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-02.</b> Timber Harvest	Yes <sup>2</sup>	NA	Yes <sup>2</sup>	Yes <sup>2</sup>	Yes <sup>2</sup>
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-03.</b> Road Construction	No	NA	No	No	No <sup>4</sup>
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-04.</b> Prescribed Fire	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-05.</b> Livestock Grazing	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-06.</b> Minerals Materials-Saleable	Yes <sup>1</sup>	NA	Yes <sup>1</sup>	Yes <sup>1</sup>	No <sup>1</sup>

Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative

Management Action	Alt W	Alt X	Alt Y	Alt Z	Preferred Alt
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-07.</b> Minerals Material-Leasable	Yes <sup>1</sup>	NA	Yes <sup>1</sup>	Yes <sup>1</sup>	No <sup>1</sup>
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-08.</b> Minerals Materials-Locatable	Yes <sup>1</sup>	NA	Yes <sup>1</sup>	Yes <sup>1</sup>	Yes
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-09.</b> Construction of new buildings <sup>3</sup> or structures	No	NA	No	No	No
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-10.</b> Maintenance of existing buildings <sup>3</sup> and structures	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-11.</b> Over-snow vehicle use	No	NA	No	Yes	No
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-123.</b> Recreational motorized travel	No	NA	No	No	No
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-13.</b> Recreational mechanized travel (e.g., bicycles, game carts)	No	NA	No	Yes	No
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-14.</b> Commercial Use of Permanent Structures.	Yes	NA	Yes	No	No
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-15.</b> Rental cabins, rental fire lookouts	Yes	NA	Yes	No	Yes
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-16.</b> Recreational aircraft landing, including unmanned aircraft systems	No	NA	No	Yes	No
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-17.</b> Administrative use of mechanized and motorized equipment, including use by partners and volunteers under agreement with the Nez Perce-Clearwater	Yes	NA	No	Yes	Yes
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-18.</b> Recreational special use permits (e.g., outfitter and guide, recreation event) if consistent with wilderness character	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-19.</b> Pesticide, and biocontrol use	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>MA2-SUIT-RWILD-20.</b> Administrative uses (e.g., research, monitoring, aircraft landing including unmanned aircraft) related to management responsibilities, including by other federal and state agencies in coordination with the NPCLW	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes

1Minerals activities may be allowed only to the extent permitted in the Idaho Roadless Rule (36 CFR 294.25 Mineral Activities in Idaho Roadless Areas)

2Timber cutting, sale or removal may be allowed only to the extent permitted in the Idaho Roadless Rule (36 CFR 294.24- Timber cutting, sale or removal in Idaho Roadless Areas)

3Building is defined as a structure designed to be inhabited.

4Road construction and reconstruction may be allowed only to the extent permitted in the Idaho Roadless Rule (36 CFR 294.23- Road construction and reconstruction in Idaho Roadless Areas)

**Table 3. Comparison of objectives by alternative (Alt)**

Alternative Rate of progress towards DC's	Objective Reference	Alt W	Alt X	Alt Y	Alt Z	Preferred Alt
<b>Forest Vegetation</b>						
PTSQ - SYL of 241	FW-OBJ-TBR-01	220-241 mmbf	241– 261 mmbf DEPARTURE	120-140 mmbf	60-80 mmbf	190-210 mmbf
PWSQ	FW-OBJ-TBR-02	56.5	58.7	47	31.6	37-43

Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative

Alternative Rate of progress towards DC's	Objective Reference	Alt W	Alt X	Alt Y	Alt Z	Preferred Alt
Restoration Acres through Timber Harvest Annually	N/A	12,600	14,000	7,500	3,700	8,825- 10,000
<b>To meet the restoration acres listed above, every 5 years the following acres by MA and PVT should be restored:</b>						
Restoration acres in Management Area 2 through harvest and/or prescribed fire	MA2-OBJ-FOR-01	28,400	28,800	34,000	35,000	27,118
MA 3 Warm Dry Veg Acres Restored with Timber Harvest	MA3-OBJ-FOR-01	14,500	17,800	9,200	2,400	18,832
MA 3 Warm Moist Veg Acres Restored with Timber Harvest	MA3-OBJ-FOR-02	42,100	43,600	24,600	14,500	34,440
MA 3 Cool Moist Veg Acres Restored with Timber Harvest	MA3-OBJ-FOR-03	4,800	4,800	3,100	2,300	5,840
MA 3 Cold Veg Acres Restored with Timber Harvest	MA3-OBJ-FOR-04	2,300	500	1,400	400	530
<b>Intermediate Harvest (Thinning)</b>						
Acres MA2 Warm Dry PVT Ponderosa Pine Planting Following Fire. Every 5 years.	MA2-OBJ-FOR-02	250				
Acres MA2 Warm Moist PVT Western White Pine/Western Larch Planting Following Fire. Every 5 years.		250				
Acres MA2 Cool Moist PVT Whitebark Pine Planting Following Fire. Every 5 years.		1000				
Acres MA2 Cold PVT Whitebark Pine Planting Following Fire. Every 5 years.		100				
Acres of aspen restored annually	FW-OBJ-FOR-01	925	1,400	550	275	680
<b>Meadows, Grasslands, and Shrublands</b>						
Acres existing meadows and grasslands maintained by reducing conifer encroachment. Every 5 years.	FW-OBJ-GS-01	2500				500
<b>Fire Management</b>						
Acres improving or maintaining desired conditions using wildland fire and other vegetation treatments based on historical disturbance regimes. Per decade over the life of the plan.	FW-OBJ-FIRE-01	375,000				530,000- 645,000
Acres hazardous fuel mitigation. Treatment includes initial entry and maintenance to ensure desired conditions are achieved per decade.	FW-OBJ-FIRE-02	131,338	128,531	133,550	125,662	227,242

Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative

<b>Alternative Rate of progress towards DC's</b>	<b>Objective Reference</b>	<b>Alt W</b>	<b>Alt X</b>	<b>Alt Y</b>	<b>Alt Z</b>	<b>Preferred Alt</b>
Acres allowing fire to play its natural role where appropriate and desirable to reduce the risk of uncharacteristic and undesirable wildland fires by managing natural, unplanned ignitions to meet resource objectives per decade over the life of the plan.	FW-OBJ-FIRE-03	243,662	246,469	241,450	249,338	360,258
<b>Invasive Species</b>						
Acres of invasive plant species treated annually	FW-OBJ-INV-01	6,000				
<b>Soil Quality and Productivity</b>						
Acres of impaired soil restored annually within timber harvest units. See water section for other soil rehab.	FW-OBJ-SOIL-01	1,900	2,100	1,200	600	175-200
<b>Water and Aquatic Ecosystems</b>						
Priority watersheds as identified under the Watershed Condition Framework. Complete highest priority work identified in WRAPs. Every 15 yrs.	FW-OBJ-WTR-01	18	20	15	10	15
Stream habitat restoration miles. Activities include, but are not limited to, berm removal, large woody debris placement, road decommissioning/storm proofing, riparian planting, & channel reconstruction. Every 5 yrs.	FW-OBJ-WTR-02	400	400	300	200	50-100
Enhance or restore stream habitat miles. Every 5 yrs.	FW-OBJ-WTR-03	N/A				5
Reconnect miles of aquatic habitat in streams disconnected by roads or culverts. Every 5 yrs.	FW-OBJ-WTR-04	10 to 20				
Acres of improved soil/watershed conditions with emphasis on priority watersheds under Conservation Watershed Network. This includes non-system road decommissioning. Every 5 yrs.	FW-OBJ-WTR-05	5,000	5,300	4,000	2,500	3,000-4,000
Miles of road surveys regardless of maintenance level to identify those roads that either have the potential to, or are, most negatively interacting with adjacent streams. Every 5 years.	FW-OBJ-CWN-01	500 maintenance level 1 roads only				500
Percent of roads storm proofed in Conservation Watershed Network watersheds. Every 5 yrs.	FW-OBJ-CWN-02	20	20	15	10	15
Acres of Riparian Habitat Improved. Every 5 years.	FW-OBJ-RMZ-01	300 to 700				
Number of existing dispersed recreation sites removed, relocated, or mitigated outside of RMZs. Every 5 years.	FW-OBJ-ARREC-01	2				a minimum of 2

**Wildlife**



Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative

Alternative Rate of progress towards DC's	Objective Reference	Alt W	Alt X	Alt Y	Alt Z	Preferred Alt
Acres treated for invasive weeds in elk habitat. Every 5 yrs.	MA1-OBJ-WLMU-01	500				
Percentage of treatments used to accomplish desired conditions for vegetation in early seral habitats over rolling five-year time window targeted in areas with moderate or preferably high nutritional capacity. Treatments should be designed and implemented to promote and sustain high nutritional capacity for at least 10 years.	MA2-OBJ-ELK-01	At least 50				N/A
Acres of vegetative treatments and wildland fire allowed to achieve vegetation desired conditions. Preferably in areas with high nutritional capacity to contribute to high quality nutritional resources for elk. Annually.	MA2-OBJ-WLMU-01	10,000 to 15,000 – wildland fire only				10,000-15,000
Acres of improved elk habitat use in MA 3 with moderate or high potential nutritional resources focused on areas more than one half mile from roads open motorized system routes. Every 15 yrs.	MA3-OBJ-WLMU-01	N/A				19,000
<b>Tribal Trust Responsibilities</b>						
Acres of Huckleberry Restored. Every 5 years.	FW-OBJ-TT-01	1,000				
Acres of Camas Restored. Primarily through wildland fire. Every 5 years.	FW-OBJ-TT-02	50				
<b>Cultural Resources</b>						
Number of sites evaluated every year.	FW-OBJ-CR-01	15				
Number of sites nominated every three years to the National Historic Register.	FW-OBJ-CR-02	1				
Acres inventoried annually for presence of cultural resources.	FW-OBJ-CR-03	200				
Number of public outreach projects conducted annually.	FW-OBJ-CR-04	1				
Number of recreation sites where effects to cultural resources is stopped or mitigated. Every 5 yrs.	FW-OBJ-CR-05	N/A				2
<b>Sustainable Recreation</b>						
Percentage NFS trails maintained to standard. Annually.	FW-OBJ-REC-01	Up to 30				
Percentage reduction of deferred maintenance on NFS trails. Every 5 years.	FW-OBJ-REC-02	5				

Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative

Alternative Rate of progress towards DC's	Objective Reference	Alt W	Alt X	Alt Y	Alt Z	Preferred Alt
<b>Infrastructure</b>						
Road work on miles of FS system roads such as reconstruction; re-routing; road improvements; decommissioning; or placing roads in intermittent stored service. Priorities shall include roads reducing effects on desired aquatic and riparian conditions from chronic sediment delivery or potential future road prism failures, including previously decommissioned roads where drainage features have failed. Every 5 years.	FW-OBJ-INF-01	30-intermittent stored service or decommissioned only				600
		1,000	1,100	600	300	
Miles of Maintenance level 2 through 5 roads maintained. Annually.	FW-OBJ-INF-02	1,900	2,000	1,400	1,000	1,400
Number of facilities projects completed to improve energy efficiency or safety. Every 2 years.	FW-OBJ-INF-03	1				
<b>Land Ownership and Land Uses</b>						
Percentage of obsolete or unused facilities not present on the landscape	FW-OBJ-LND-01	100				N/A
Percentage of communication sites that have approved communication site plans.	FW-OBJ-LND-02	100				N/A
<b>Lolo Trail National Historic Landmark</b>						
Number of vista opportunities maintained or enhanced through wildland fire. Open view of the prairies to the west and southwest. Over the life of the LMP.	GA-OBJ-NHL-01	1				
Number of landmark interpretation projects completed. Every 5 years.	GA-OBJ-NHL-02	1				
Percentage of non-system roads naturalized within NHL within 15 years.	MA1-OBJ-NHL-03	100				N/A
<b>Recommended Wilderness</b>						
Percentage of activities or uses that are not allowed in the forest plan's record of decision removed through site-specific planning within five years.	MA2-OBJ-RWILD-01	100				
<b>Research Natural Areas (RNAs)</b>						
Percentage of proposed RNAs with completed establishment reports and finalized designation within 10 years.	MA2-OBJ-RNA-01	100				N/A

Appendix H: Comparison of Direction by Alternative

Alternative Rate of progress towards DC's	Objective Reference	Alt W	Alt X	Alt Y	Alt Z	Preferred Alt
<b>Gospel Hump Geographic Area</b>						
Acres of forested vegetation treated through silvicultural means within Big Meadows Area over a 10-year period.	GA-OBJ-GH-01	500				
Acres of pre-commercial thinning within Big Meadows Area completed over a 10-year period.	GA-OBJ-GH-02	250				
Acres of hazardous fuels treated in the Indian Creek Area over a 5-year period.	GA-OBJ-GH-03	250				
Acres of roadside hazard trees mitigated in the Indian Creek Area within the first 5 years.	GA-OBJ-GH-04	250				
Acres of pre-commercial thinning within Big Meadows Area completed over a 10-year period.	GA-OBJ-GH-02	500				250
<b>Lower Salmon River Geographic Area</b>						
Acres of mountain quail habitat restored in each five-year period.	GA-OBJ-SR-01	100				